

## **PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD**

**MONDAY, DECEMBER 5, 2005**

**3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II**

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members: Kirk, Kreider, Raser, Spraul-Schmidt, and Sullebarger present. Absent: Bloomfield, Chatterjee, Senhauser, and Wallace.

### **MINUTES**

The Board unanimously approved the minutes of the Monday, November 7, 2005 meeting (motion by Raser, second by Kirk) and those for the Monday, November 21, 2005 meeting (motion by Sullebarger, second by Kirk).

### **2006 MEETING SCHEDULE**

The Board discussed the proposed 2006 meeting schedule. Those members present agreed that if a Board member wished to modify the schedule, he/she should notify the Urban Conservator before the next meeting on December 19, 2005.

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1890 MADISON ROAD, EAST WALNUT HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented a report for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing rear ell and to construct a new kitchen addition at 1890 Madison Road. Ms. Cowden indicated that the present addition was built shortly after the main house, likely as an open porch. Since its construction, the ell has been substantially altered. It was enclosed for a kitchen and a large skylight was installed to increase the ceiling height and natural light in the space.

Although the ell is a contributing addition, its condition has deteriorated and the low ceiling heights make its reuse difficult. Ms. Cowden stated that the skylight is leaking, resulting in water damage to the kitchen, an interior stair, an oriel window, and the exterior masonry walls. The new kitchen addition will correct the physical constraints of the existing kitchen and preclude further damage to the main house. The replacement addition will be built on the footprint of the existing ell, but with full-height ceilings and modern mechanical systems. Material and product selections have not been finalized. However, some of the original elements including the basement windows and the Greek Ionic columns will be salvaged for reuse. Due to extensive rot, the balustrade will be replaced with fyon elements molded to match the original millwork. Stone and brick will be used for the foundation/basement and exterior walls respectively.

Although the new addition meets the conservation guidelines, the proposed demolition does not. Nonetheless, staff recommended that the Board approve the project as a whole. Demolition of the ell will allow damage caused by the skylight to be corrected/repared. A new kitchen addition will make the entire house more usable and will not adversely affect the larger historic district.

Marvel and Robert Hecking, the applicants and contract purchasers, were present to answer questions from the Board. Mr. Hecking described similar projects that he has completed in New Jersey and assured the Board that the new addition will be done to the highest standards.

In answer to Mr. Kirk, Mr. Hecking stated that the addition's porch will match that on the main (north) façade. It will extend out from the addition the same distance and will have the same curved perimeter.

In response to Ms. Sullebarger, Mr. Hecking confirmed the exterior stairs will be reoriented to avoid exiting onto the driveway.

Mr. Kreider stated he agreed with staff's recommendations. He expressed his belief that the ell had been notably altered and that the deterioration of the ell (as well as damage caused by the skylight) is likely the reason why the property has been on the market for so long. He indicated that the design was compatible with the house and that the staff could ensure compatible materials/products were selected.

**BOARD ACTION:**

The Board voted (motion by Sullebarger, second Kirk) to take the followings actions:

1. Find that the existing circumstances and proposal for 1890 Madison Road are unique to the specific property.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed new addition, finding that
  - a. The addition meets the East Walnut Hills Historic District conservation guidelines;
  - b. The proposal will not adversely affect the East Walnut Hills Historic District; and
  - c. No feasible or prudent alternative will permit the applicants' full, unrestricted use of existing ell.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the rear ell only in association with the construction of the proposed new addition. Demolition shall not occur without the subsequent new construction, as approved by the Historic Conservation Board and the Urban Conservator.
3. Final construction drawings and material/product selections shall be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval prior to construction.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 3741 MORRIS PLACE, COLUMBIA  
TUSCULUM HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam presented a staff report for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace an existing rear porch and kitchen addition at 3741 Morris Place with a new addition. The new wood frame addition will be the same width as the present porch but four feet deeper to accommodate a larger kitchen. The materials will match or simulate those on the house.

Rick and Gina Breitbeil, the property owners, and their contractor, Keith Beal, were present to answer questions from the Board. Mr. Beal indicated that a larger kitchen would better meet the Breitbeil's need and that the new addition will be compatible in style and materials to their house and the neighborhood. Upon inquiry Mr. Beal would reinstall a window salvaged from the rear wall of the existing addition on the new addition.

Mr. Kirk questioned whether the new addition should have a steeper slope, closer to that of the existing porch and the house. Mr. Beal stated that his clients considered this option, but it required closing a second floor window. He also felt the shallower hip roof on the addition preserved the scale of the house. Mr. Beal informed the Board that the addition would have membrane roof.

Mr. Kirk also suggested that the rear door be offset (rather than centered on the rear wall) to preserve the asymmetry of the existing porch and storage room. Mr. Beal responded that the door was located based on the interior layout. It was agreed that the location of the door be reevaluated, but that either composition would be acceptable.

**BOARD ACTION:**

The Historic Conservation Board voted (motioned by Sullebarger, second by Kreider) to take the following action with amendments:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the existing rear porch and storage room and portion of the rear wall finding it is necessary in order to expand the kitchen.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the new addition with the following conditions:
  - a) The exposed foundation wall should simulate rusticated stone or be concealed with evergreen landscaping.
  - b) The east elevation along Donham Street should feature at least one vertical opening similar in proportion to those windows on the house and that the applicant consider an addition window or offset door on the south elevation.
  - c) Final plans be reviewed and approved by the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.

**ADJOURN**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: \_\_\_\_\_